

Appendix 6.6. Rubric: Identifying and Analyzing Theme

Domain	Emerging	Developing	Proficient
Identifying Theme	Identified a general topic that reflects the poem; may tend to summarize.	Identified a clear idea that reflects the poem; Idea may not reflect a unifying concept about sports and/or the human condition.	Identified a clear central idea of the poem; this theme reflects an understanding of both the content of the poem and a shared experience of sports and/or the human condition.
Analyzing Theme	Explains how the general topic reflects the poem and may attempt to connect this topic to human experiences.	Explains how the theme is present in the poem and explains some connection between this theme and the human experience; may not recognize how the theme develops over the course of the text.	Explains how the theme is present in multiple areas of the text, including how the central idea may shift over the course of the text; articulates how the theme represents some aspect of sports culture and/or the human condition; demonstrates insight.
Use of Supporting Evidence	Can cite EITHER specific parts of the poem or background knowledge to support the general topic. Evidence may not be a strong “fit” for the theme.	Cites specific and multiple examples of evidence from the text of the poem to support the theme. Attempts to connect textual evidence to background knowledge. Evidence demonstrates a relevant fit and supports the theme.	Cites specific, multiple, and varied evidence from the text as well as background knowledge to support and elaborate on the discussion of theme. Evidence provides a strong “fit” with identified theme and functions to expand understanding.

Rubric: Comparing Themes

Domain	Emerging	Developing	Proficient
Thematic Comparison	Identifies two separate themes (one for each poem); attempts to discuss at least one similarity or difference between the themes.	Identifies two separate themes (one for each poem); discusses how each theme relates to the other in terms of similarities and differences. Discussion may overgeneralize or lack specificity.	Identifies two separate themes (one for each poem); discusses how each theme relates to the other; comparisons and contrasts demonstrate depth of thinking and /or create an insightful understanding between the poems.
Thematic Analysis	Discusses themes separately; attempts to forge a connection between each theme and sports culture and /or the human experience; connection may not be effective or complete.	Discusses themes in relation to each other; uses both poems to explain a connection between the poems and sports culture and the human condition; connections are effective but may not consistently demonstrate depth of thinking; conclusions may overgeneralize.	Discusses both themes coherently to reflect insight about sports culture and the human experience; reaches an insightful conclusion that demonstrates close reading and depth of thinking; conclusions reflect textual knowledge as well as effective connections with the human experience.
Use of Supporting Evidence	Cites specific aspects of at least one poem to support the thematic comparison.	Cites specific aspects of both poems to support conclusions; incorporates relevant background knowledge; uses evidence that "fits"; evidence may not reflect a balance of analysis between poems.	Cites specific and balanced evidence from both poems; incorporates insightful connections to background knowledge; uses evidence that works to strengthen and deepen analysis.